RED CROSS BUILDING, MADHYA MARG, SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.
Helpline 0172-2864100 Phone No-0172-2864120

Email: <u>psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in</u> Visit us - <u>www.infocommpunjab.com</u>
<u>Bench: Sh. Sanjiv Garg, State Information Commissioner, Punjab.</u>



Sh. Rajinder Singh,

H.No. 352 / 1, Mohalla Sagran,

Adampur Doaba, District Jalandhar. (144102)

M: 98154-05583

Complainant

V/s.

**Public Information Officer**,

**O/o** The Department of Local Bodies, Punjab, Sector 35-A, Chandigarh.

Respondent

Complaint Case No. 458 of 2021

{Heard through Cisco Webex Meetings Software }

**Present**: The Complainant, Sh. Rajinder Singh is absent.

Sh. Karanjit Singh, Building Inspector is present from the Department.

ORDER:

Dated: 18.01.2022

This order may be read with the reference of the previous order dated 09.11.2021.

In today's hearing, the Complainant, Sh. Rajinder Singh is absent.

On the other hand, the Building Inspector, Sh. Karanjit Singh states that the information has been supplied to the Complainant, Sh. Rajinder Singh and the Complainant, Sh. Rajinder Singh is satisfied with the same. In relating to this he further mentions about an email dated 23.12.2021 which has been sent to the Commission from the department and also an another email dated 18.01.2022 has been sent by the department in which an acknowledgement receipt dated 13.12.2021 signed by the Complainant is attached.

In view of above, after going through signed letter of the Appellant, Sh. Rajinder Singh dated 13.12.2021 it has been observed that he has received the information and moreover, no deficiency letter or deficiency email has been received from the Appellant's side to the department concerned as well as to the bench of undersigned after receiving the information.

So, no further intervention is required in this case.

## This case is disposed of and closed.

Copy of the order be sent to the parties.

RED CROSS BUILDING, MADHYA MARG, SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.
Helpline 0172-2864100 Phone No-0172-2864120

Email: <u>psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in</u> Visit us - <u>www.infocommpunjab.com</u>
<u>Bench: Sh. Sanjiv Garg, State Information Commissioner, Punjab.</u>



Sh. Niranjan Singh, (99888-54725)

H. No. 1681, Street Guruan Wali, Jandiala Guru, District Amritsar.

V/s.

**Public Information Officer**,

**0/o** The Additional Deputy Commissioner, (Development), Tarn Taran. (Punjab)

Respondent

Complainant

Complaint Case No. 339 of 2020

{Heard through Cisco Webex Meetings Software }

**Present:** The Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh is present.

Ms. Paramjit Kaur, ADC Development Tarn Taran is present from the Department.

ORDER:

On the last hearing dated 09.11.2021, both the parties were absent and a show cause notice which was issued to the concerned PIO and was directed to appear on the next date of hearing i.e. today through Cisco Webex Meeting Software. On the other side, the Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh was directed to appear on the next date of hearing i.e. today through Cisco Webex Meeting Software.

In today's hearing, the Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh states that no information has been supplied to him.

On the other hand, the ADC, Ms. Paramjit Kaur states that the Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh is asking for her personal documents which could not be supplied and further mentions about a letter dated 09.08.2021 signed by Under Secretary, which has been sent to the Commission along with other documents vide email dated 11.01.2022 and is taken on record.

After hearing the parties and examining the documents placed in the case-file, it emerges that the information sought for by the complainant through his RTI request is 'personal information' in nature and could not be supplied.

Moreover, through Para 59 of Decision dated 13.11.2019, the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, in Civil Appeal no. 10044 of 2010 titled Central Public Information Officer, Supreme Court of India Vs. Subash Chander Agarwal, has defined 'Personal Information' under RTI Act, 2005 and the relevant operative part of the Judgment is reproduced below;

#### XXX XXX XXX

"Reading of the aforesaid judicial precedents, in our opinion, would indicate that personal records, including name, address, physical, mental and psychological status, marks obtained, grades and answer sheets, are all treated as Personal Information. Similarly, professional records, including qualification, performance, evaluation reports, ACRs, disciplinary proceedings etc. are all Personal Information". Medical records, treatment, choice of medicine, list of hospitals and doctors visited, findings recorded, including that of the family members, information relating to assets, liabilities, income tax returns, detail of investments, lending and borrowing, etc. are Personal Information". Such "Personal Information" is entitled to protection from unwarranted invasion of privacy and conditional access is available when stipulation invasion "Larger Public Interest" is satisfied. This list is indicative and not exhaustive."

#### XXX XXX XXX

As the information sought for by the complainant through his RTI request is 'personal information' in nature and the information-seeker also failed to establish the fact that information sought for by him is in larger public interest, hence, the above-mentioned complaint is not maintainable and **announced as disposed of and closed.** 

Also, the Show cause notice which was issued to the concerned PIO vide order dated 17.08.2021 be <u>dropped</u>.

So, no further action is required in this case.

Copy of the orders be sent to the parties.

Dated: 18.01.2022

RED CROSS BUILDING, MADHYA MARG, SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH. Helpline 0172-2864100 Phone No-0172-2864120

Email: psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us - www.infocommpunjab.com Bench: Sh. Sanjiv Garg, State Information Commissioner, Punjab.



Sh. Niranjan Singh, (99888-54725)

H. No. 1681, Street Guruan Wali, Jandiala Guru, District Amritsar.

V/s.

**Public Information Officer**,

**O/o** The Additional Deputy Commissioner, (Development), Tarn Taran. (Punjab)

Respondent

Complainant

Complaint Case No. 341 of 2020 {Heard through Cisco Webex Meetings Software }

The Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh is present. Present:

Ms. Paramjit Kaur, ADC Development Tarn Taran is present from the Department.

ORDER:

On the last hearing dated 09.11.2021, both the parties were absent and a show cause notice which was issued to the concerned PIO and was directed to appear on the next date of hearing i.e. today through Cisco Webex Meeting Software. On the other side, the Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh was directed to appear on the next date of hearing i.e. today through Cisco Webex Meeting Software.

In today's hearing, the Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh states that no information has been supplied to him.

On the other hand, the ADC, Ms. Paramjit Kaur states that the Complainant, Sh. Niranjan Singh is asking for her personal documents which could not be supplied and further mentions about a letter dated 09.08.2021 signed by Under Secretary, which has been sent to the Commission along with other documents vide email dated 11.01.2022 and is taken on record.

After hearing the parties and examining the documents placed in the case-file, it emerges that the information sought for by the complainant through his RTI request is 'personal information' in nature and could not be supplied.

Moreover, through Para 59 of Decision dated 13.11.2019, the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, in Civil Appeal no. 10044 of 2010 titled Central Public Information Officer, Supreme Court of India Vs. Subash Chander Agarwal, has defined 'Personal Information' under RTI Act, 2005 and the relevant operative part of the Judgment is reproduced below;

#### XXX XXX XXX

"Reading of the aforesaid judicial precedents, in our opinion, would indicate that personal records, including name, address, physical, mental and psychological status, marks obtained, grades and answer sheets, are all treated as Personal Information. Similarly, professional records, including qualification, performance, evaluation reports, ACRs, disciplinary proceedings etc. are all Personal Information". Medical records, treatment, choice of medicine, list of hospitals and doctors visited, findings recorded, including that of the family members, information relating to assets, liabilities, income tax returns, detail of investments, lending and borrowing, etc. are Personal Information". Such "Personal Information" is entitled to protection from unwarranted invasion of privacy and conditional access is available when stipulation invasion "Larger Public Interest" is satisfied. This list is indicative and not exhaustive."

#### XXX XXX XXX

As the information sought for by the complainant through his RTI request is 'personal information' in nature and the information-seeker also failed to establish the fact that information sought for by him is in larger public interest, hence, the above-mentioned complaint is not maintainable and announced as disposed of and closed.

Also, the Show cause notice which was issued to the concerned PIO vide order dated 17.08.2021 be dropped.

So, no further action is required in this case.

Copy of the orders be sent to the parties.

Sd/-(Sanjiv Garg) State Information Commissioner **Punjab** 

Dated: 18.01.2022

RED CROSS BUILDING, MADHYA MARG, SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.
Helpline No- 0172-2864100 Phone No- 0172-2864120

Email: <u>psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in</u> Visit us - <u>www.infocommpunjab.com</u> Bench: Sh. Sanjiv Garg, State Information Commissioner, Punjab.



Sh. Surjit Singh Aujla,

Village Ahujla Dak, PO Lidar Kalan, District Jalandhar.(144502) M: 98767-57790

V/s.

Appellant

**Public Information Officer**,

**O/o** The Executive Engineer, Water Supply and Sanitation, Division Number 01, Jalandhar.

First Appellate Authority,

**O/o** The Superintending Engineer, Water Supply and Sanitation, Division Number 01, Jalandhar.

Respondent

## **Appeal Case No. 2997 of 2021**

{Heard through Cisco Webex Meetings Software}

**Present**: The Appellant, Sh. Surjit Singh Aujla is present.

Sh. Sukhwinder Mahi, Sub Division Engineer is present from the Department.

ORDER:

Dated: 18.01.2022

This order may be read with the reference of the previous order dated 11.11.2021.

In today's hearing, the Appellant, Sh. Surjit Singh states that the information has been supplied to him and he is satisfied with the same.

On the other hand, SDE, Sh. Sukhwinder Mahi states that the information has been supplied to the Appellant. He further mentions about an email dated 17.01.2022 which has been sent to the Commission and is taken on record.

In view of above, as the Appellant is satisfied with the supplied information.

So, no further intervention is required in this case.

## This case is disposed of and closed.

Copy of the orders be sent to the parties.

RED CROSS BUILDING, MADHYA MARG, SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.
Helpline No- 0172-2864100 Phone No- 0172-2864120
Email: <a href="mailto:psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in">psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in</a> Visit us - <a href="mailto:www.infocommpunjab.com">www.infocommpunjab.com</a>
Bench: Sh. Sanjiv Garg, State Information Commissioner, Punjab.



Sh. Hakam Singh, S/o Sh. Darshan Singh,

R/o Madhir, Tehsil Gidderbaha,

Distt. Sri Muktsar Sahib. (M: 99146-92355)

Complainant

**Public Information Officer**,

**O/o** The Director, Local Government Department, Punjab, Sector 35-A, Chandigarh.

**Public Information Officer**,

**O/o** The Executive Officer, Municipal Council, Giddarbaha, Distt. Sri Muktsar Sahib.(Punjab)

Respondent

# Complaint Case No. 550 of 2021 {Heard through Cisco Webex Meeting Software}

V/s.

**Present**: The Complainant, Sh. Hakam Singh is present.

Sh. Amit Kumar, Senior Assistant from office of Local Government, Punjab Chandigarh is present from

the Department.

## ORDER:

Dated: 18.01.2022

This case was last heard on 31.08.2021 and was adjourned for 17.11.2021 but on 17.11.2021 it could not held due to technical fault in connection of network and is adjourned for today.

In today's hearing, the Complainant, Sh. Hakam Singh states that he has received the information and he is satisfied with the same.

On the other hand, the Senior Assistant, Sh. Amit Kumar states that the information has already been supplied to the Complainant, Sh. Hakam Singh.

In view of above, as the Complainant, Sh. Hakam Singh is satisfied. So, no further intervention is required in this case.

This case is disposed of and closed.

Copy of the order be sent to the parties.

RED CROSS BUILDING, MADHYA MARG, SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.
Helpline 0172-2864100 Phone No-0172-2864120

Email: <a href="mailto:psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in">psicsic31@punjabmail.gov.in</a> Visit us - <a href="https://www.infocommpunjab.com">www.infocommpunjab.com</a>
Bench: Sh. Sanjiv Garg, State Information Commissioner, Punjab.



Sh. Shallinder Singh, S/o Sh. Surinder Singh,

# 4 - E, Kailash Nagar, Fazilka (152123) (Punjab)

M: 9855530060

Appellant

Public Information Officer,

**O/o** The Executive Engineer (Civil), Punjab Mandi Board, Fazilka.

First Appellate Authority,

**O/o** The Chief Engineer (North / South), Punjab Mandi Board, Mandi Bhawan, Sector 65, S.A.S Nagar (Mohali) Punjab

Respondent

**Appeal Case No. 2380 of 2020** 

V/s.

{Heard through Cisco Webex Meetings Software }

**Present**: The Appellant, Sh. Shallinder Singh is absent.

Sh. Kashmiri Lal, Senior Assistant is present from the Department.

ORDER:

This case was last heard on 14.09.2021 and was adjourned for 30.11.2021 but on 30.11.2021 it could not held due to technical fault in connection of network and is adjourned for today.

In today's hearing, the Appellant, Sh. Shallinder Singh is absent without any intimation to the Commission.

On the other hand, the Senior Assistant, Sh. Kashmiri Lal states that the information has already been supplied to the Appellant, Sh. Shallinder Singh vide registered post dated 08.09.2021. He further mentions about an email dated 18.01.2022 which has been sent to the Commission and is taken on record.

On the last date of hearing dated 14.09.2021 the Appellant, Sh. Shallinder Singh is absent and today he is again absent without any intimation to the Commission.

In view of above, it has been observed that the status of this case is same as it was on the previous date of hearing dated 14.09.2021.

From the previous hearings, it has been observed that the department has given their reply to the Appellant and further no reply or deficiency email / letter has been filed by the Appellant to the concerned department as well as to the undersigned relating to today's hearing.

This presumes that the Appellant, Sh. Shallinder Singh is satisfied with the supplied reply / information or he doesnot wants to pursue this case.

In view of above, no further intervention is required in this case.

This case is disposed of and closed.

Copy of the order be sent to the parties.

Sd/-(Sanjiv Garg) State Information Commissioner Punjab

Dated: 18.01.2022